

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 03330 3777

FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW: CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Fall 1996

*These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.*

Storage

AXY 676J
BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 22 1996

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FIRST NATIONS AND THE LAW:
CASES AND MATERIALS

VOLUME I

Patrick Macklem
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Fall 1996

*These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of
students of the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.*

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Page

Volume I

I. INTRODUCTION

Georges Erasmus and Joe Sanders, *Canadian History: An Aboriginal Perspective*, in *Nation to Nation: Aboriginal Sovereignty and the Future of Canada* (Englestad & Bird eds. 1992) 3-11 1

Alan D. McMillan, *Native Peoples and Cultures of Canada* (Vancouver: Douglas and McIntyre, 1988) 7

II. THE POLITICS OF INDIGENOUS DIFFERENCE

The Justice System and Aboriginal People, in 1 *Report of the Aboriginal Justice Inquiry of Manitoba* (1991) 115-117 31

Fred Plain, *A Treatise on the Rights of the Aboriginal Peoples of the Continent of North America*, in *The Quest for Justice: Aboriginal Peoples and Aboriginal Rights* (Boldt & Long eds. 1985), 31-40 33

Russel Lawrence Barsh and James Youngblood Henderson, *The Road: Indian Tribes and Political Liberty* (1980), 270-79 42

Will Kymlicka, *Liberalism, Community and Culture* (1991) 44

III. THE CONSTITUTIONAL FRAMEWORK

R. v. Sparrow, [1990] 1 S.C.R. 1075 49

Note on *R. v. Nikal* (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 26, 1996).....69

Note on *R. v. Badger* (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 3, 1996).....72

IV. ABORIGINAL TITLE

A. The Royal Proclamation

The Royal Proclamation of 1763, R.S.C. 1970, App. II, No. 173

	Brian Slattery, <i>The Hidden Constitution: Aboriginal Rights in Canada</i> (1984), 32 Amer. J. Comp. Law 361, at 368-72	74
B.	The Marshall Trilogy	
	<i>Johnson v. M'Intosh</i> , 21 U.S. (8 Wheat.) 543 (1823)	78
	<i>Cherokee Nation v. Georgia</i> , 30 U.S. (5 Pet.) 1 (1831)	83
	<i>Worcester v. Georgia</i> , 31 U.S. (6 Pet.) 515 (1832)	86
C.	The House of Lords	
	<i>St. Catherines Milling and Lumber Co. v. The Queen</i> (1888), 14 A.C. 46 (P.C.)	97
	<i>In re Southern Rhodesia</i> , [1919] A.C. 211 (P.C.)	102
	<i>Amodu Tijani v. The Secretary, Southern Nigeria</i> , [1921] 2 A.C. 399 (P.C.)	108
D.	Canadian Principles	
	<i>Calder v. Attorney General of British Columbia</i> (1973), 34 D.L.R. (3d) 145 (S.C.C.)	115
	<i>Hamlet of Baker Lake v. Minister of Indian Affairs and Northern Development</i> , [1980] 1 F.C. 518 (F.C.T.D.)	128
	<i>Delgamuukw v. British Columbia</i> (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.).....	141
	Note on <i>R. v. Van der Peet</i> , [1993] 4 C.N.L.R. 221 (B.C.C.A.).....	162
E.	Fiduciary Duty	
	<i>Guerin v. The Queen</i> (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 321 (S.C.C.).....	165
	<i>Apsassin v. Canada (Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development)</i> (1993), 100 D.L.R. (4th) 504 (F.C.A.)	177
	<i>Grand Council of the Crees v. Canada (National Energy Board)</i> (1994), 112 D.L.R. (4th) 129 (S.C.C.)	188

V. THE DISTRIBUTION OF LEGISLATIVE AUTHORITY

Douglas Sanders, *The Constitution, the Provinces, and Aboriginal People*, in *Governments in Conflict: Provinces and Indian Nations in Canada* (Long & Boldt eds., 1988), 151-52 193

A. Federal Jurisdiction

Ontario Mining Co. v. Seybold, [1903] A.C. 73 (P.C.) 192

Re Eskimos, [1939] 2 D.L.R. 417 (S.C.C.) 194

Note on *R. v. Derricksan*, 60 D.L.R. (3d) 140 (B.C.C.A.); (1976), 71 D.L.R. (3d) 159 (S.C.C.) 201

B. Provincial Jurisdiction

Cardinal v. A.G. Alberta (1973), 40 D.L.R. (3d) 553 (S.C.C.) 202

Kruger and Manuel v. The Queen (1977), 75 D.L.R. (3d) 434 (S.C.C.) 209

Four B. Manufacturing v. United Garment Workers of America (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 385 (S.C.C.) 214

R. v. Sutherland (1980), 113 D.L.R. (3d) 374 (S.C.C.) 222

Dick v. The Queen (1985), 23 D.L.R. (4th) 33 (S.C.C.) 224

Jack and Charlie v. The Queen (1985), 21 D.L.R. (4th) 641 (S.C.C.) 233

Delgamuukw v. British Columbia (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 242

R. v. Alphonse (June 25, 1993, B.C.C.A.) 243

VI. TREATIES

Map of Pre- and Post-Confederation Treaties 243

A.	Introduction	
	Daniel J. Kuhlen, <i>A Layperson's Guide to Treaty Rights in Canada</i> (1985)	248
B.	The Classical Approach	
	<i>R. v. Syliboy</i> , [1929] 1 D.L.R. 307 (N.S. Co. Ct.)	262
C.	The Contractual Model	
	<i>Pawis v. The Queen</i> (1979), 102 D.L.R. (3d) 602 (F.C.T.D.).....	269
	Indian Chiefs of Alberta, "Citizens Plus," in <i>The Only Good Indian</i> (1983)	274
	<i>Johnston v. The Queen</i> (1966), 56 D.L.R. (2d) 749 (Sask. C.A.)	276
	<i>R. v. Sikyea</i> (1964), 43 D.L.R. (2d) 150 (N.W.T.C.A.)	278
	<i>Sikyea v. The Queen</i> , [1964] S.C.R. 642 (S.C.C.)	285
D.	Recent Developments	
	<i>R. v. Taylor and Williams</i> (1981) 34 O.R. (2d) (C.A.)	285
	<i>Simon v. The Queen</i> (1985), 24 D.L.R. (4th) 390 (S.C.C.)	294
	<i>Sannichton Marina Ltd. v. Claxton</i> (1987), 18 B.C.L.R. (2d) 217 (B.C.S.C.)	305
	<i>Horse v. The Queen</i> (1988), 47 D.L.R. (4th) 526 (S.C.C.)	311
	<i>Horseman v. The Queen</i> , [1990] 4 W.W.R. 97 (S.C.C.)	318
	<i>R. v. Sioui</i> , [1990] 70 D.L.R. (4th) 427 (S.C.C.)	332
	<i>Eastmain Band v. James Bay and Northern Quebec Agreement (Administrator)</i> (1992), 99 D.L.R. (4th) 16 (F.C.A.)	348
	<i>R. v. Howard</i> (1994), 115 D.L.R. (4th) 312 (S.C.C.)	354
	<i>R. v. Badger</i> (unreported SCC judgment rendered April 3, 1996)	359

Volume II

VII. THE INDIAN ACT

A. General Principles

- Claudia Notzke, *Aboriginal Peoples and Natural Resources in Canada* (1994) 173-181 373
- Leroy Little Bear, *Indian Government Pursuant to the Indian Act*, in *Pathways to Self-Determination: Canadian Indians and the Canadian State* (Little Bear, Boldt & Long eds. 1984) 384
- Logan v. Styres* (1959), 20 D.L.R. (2d) 416 (Ont. H.C.) 391
- R. v. Gingrich* (1958), 29 W.W.R. 471 (Alta. App. Div.) 395
- A.G.B.C. v. Wale* (1987), 9 B.C.L.R. (2d) 333 (B.C.C.A.) 398
- Frank Cassidy and Robert L. Bish, *Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice* (1989), 40-50 408

B. "Marrying Out"

- Indian Act*, R.S.C. 1970, c. I-16 417
- Lavell v. A.G. Canada* (1973), 38 D.L.R. (3d) 481 (S.C.C.) 419
- Lovelace v. Canada*, 36 U.N. GOAR Supp. (No. 40) Annex XVIII; U.N. Doc. A/36/40 (1981) 431
- Indian Act*, R.S.C. 1985, c. I-5 438
- Enough is Enough: Aboriginal Women Speak Out* (Silman ed. 1987), 215-47 440
- Catharine A. MacKinnon, *Feminism Unmodified: Discourses on Life and Law* (1987), 63-69 463

VIII. ABORIGINAL CHILD WELFARE

A. Introduction

Philip Zylberberg, *Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?* (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 75-79 468

B. "The Best Interests of the Child"

Racine v. Woods (1983), 1 D.L.R. (4th) 193 (S.C.C.) 472

B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services (1988), 51 Man. Rep. (2d) 245 (Man. C.A.) 482

B.B. v. Director of Child and Family Services, [1989] 1 S.C.R. 291 489

Tom v. Winnipeg Children's Aid Society (1982), 2 W.W.R. 212 (Man. C.A.) 489

C. Recent Developments

Philip Zylberberg, *Who Should Make Child Protection Decisions for the Native Community?* (1991), 11 Windsor Yrbk. Access to Justice 74, at 81-83 491

C.J.K. v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto, [1989] 4 C.N.L.R. 75 (Ont. Prov. Ct.) 494

Re Family and Child Service Act of British Columbia, [1990] 4 C.N.L.R. 14 (B.C. Prov. Ct.) 502

Jane Doe v. Awasis Agency of Northern Manitoba (1990), 72 D.L.R. (4th) 738 (Man. Q.B.) 510

IX. RIGHTS OF THE METIS PEOPLE

Catherine Bell, *Who Are the Métis People in Section 35(2)?* (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 351 513

Paul Chartrand, *Aboriginal Rights: The Dispossession of the Métis* (1991), 29 Osgoode Hall L.J. 457 523

	<i>Dumont v. A.G. Canada</i> (1988), 52 D.L.R. (4th) 25 (Man. C.A.)	535
	<i>Dumont v. A. G. Canada</i> (1990), 67 D.L.R. (4th) 159 (S.C.C.)	547
	<i>R. v. McPherson</i> , [1992] 4 C.N.L.R. 144 (Man. Prov. Ct.)	548
X.	FIRST NATIONS AND THE CHARTER	
	Mary Ellen Turpel, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and the Canadian Charter: Interpretive Monopolies, Cultural Differences</i> (1989-90), 6 Can. Human Rights Yrbk. 3	565
	<i>Eastmain Band v. Gilpin</i> , [1988] 3 C.N.L.R. (Que. Prov. Ct.)	570
	<i>Manitoba Rice Farmers Association v. Manitoba Human Rights Commission</i> (1987), 50 Man. R. (2d) 92 (Q.B.)	583
	<i>R. v. Willocks</i> (1995), 22 O.R. (3d) 552 (Gen. Div.)	596
	<i>Corbiere v. Canada (Minister of Indian and Northern Affairs)</i> (1993), 107 D.L.R. (4th) 582 (F.C.T.D.)	604
	<i>Sawridge Band v. Canada</i> , [1995] F.C.J. No. 1013 (F.C.T.D.)	617
	<i>Norris v. Thomas</i> , [1992] 2 C.N.L.R. 139 (B.C.S.C.)	637
	J. Anthony Long and Katherine Beaty Chiste, <i>Indian Governments and the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> (1994), 18 American Indian Culture and Research Journal 91	652
XI.	ABORIGINAL PEOPLE AND CRIMINAL JUSTICE	
	<i>R. v. Machekequonabe</i> (1898), 28 O.R. 309 (Div. Ct.)	672
	<i>Re Stacey and Montour and the Queen</i> (1981), 63 C.C.C. (2d) 61 (Que. C.A.)	674
	Michael Jackson, <i>In Search of the Pathways to Justice: Alternative Dispute Resolution in Aboriginal Communities</i> , [1992] U.B.C. L. Rev. 147, at 148-160	677
	<i>R. v. Moses</i> (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yukon Terr. Ct.)	685

Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Criminal Justice</i> (Report No. 34, 1991), at 13-23	709
Bryan Schwartz, <i>A Separate Aboriginal Justice System?</i> (1990), 28 Man. L.J. 77	718
Jeremy Webber, <i>Individuality, Equality and Difference: Justifications for a Parallel System of Aboriginal Justice</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 133	730
Teressa Nahanee, <i>Dancing With a Gorilla: Aboriginal Women, Justice and the Charter</i> (Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, 1993) 359	733
<i>R. v. F.(A.)</i> , [1995] 2 C.N.L.R. 151 (Ont. Gen. Div.)	741
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, <i>Bridging the Cultural Divide: A Report on Aboriginal People and Criminal Justice in Canada</i> (Ottawa: Supply and Services, 1996) 309-315.....	745

Volume III

XII. ABORIGINAL GOVERNMENT

A. Introduction

Chief Ovide Mercredi, <i>First Nations and Self-Determination, in Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century</i> (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 161-66	752
Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 160-66	757
Roger Gibbons, <i>Citizenship, Political, and Intergovernmental Problems With Indian Self-Government, in Arduous Journey: Canadian Indians and Decolonization</i> (Ponting ed. 1988), 369-377	761

B. Aboriginal Government and Constitutional Reform

Kathy L. Brock, <i>The Politics of Aboriginal Self-Government: A Canadian Paradox</i> (1991), 34 Can. Pub. Admin. 272	767
---	-----

J. Edward Chamberlin, <i>Aboriginal Rights and the Meech Lake Accord</i> , in <i>Competing Constitutional Visions: The Meech Lake Accord</i> (Swinton & Rogerson eds., 1988), 11-19	778
<i>Draft Legal Text of the Charlottetown Accord</i> (October 9, 1992)	784
C. Aboriginal Government and the Courts	
Michael Asch and Patrick Macklem, <i>Aboriginal Rights and Canadian Sovereignty: An Essay on R. v. Sparrow</i> (1991), 29 Alta. L. Rev. 498	790
Hamar Foster, <i>Forgotten Arguments: Aboriginal Title and Sovereignty in Canada Jurisdiction Act Cases</i> (1992), 21 Man. L.J. 343	794
Brian Slattery, <i>First Nations and the Constitution: A Question of Trust</i> (1992), 71 Can. Bar Rev. 261	804
Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, <i>Partners in Confederation: Aboriginal Peoples, Self-Government, and the Constitution</i> (1993)	813
<i>Casimel v. I.C.B.C.</i> (1993), 106 D.L.R. (4th) 720 (B.C.C.A.)	829
<i>R. v. Pamajewon and Jones; R. v. Gardner</i> (1994), 120 D.L.R. (4th) 475 (S.C.C.)	838
D. Aboriginal Government and Negotiating Processes	
Frank Cassidy and Robert Bish, <i>Indian Government: Its Meaning in Practice</i> (1989), 135-55	850
Task Force to Review Comprehensive Claims Policy, <i>Living Treaties: Lasting Agreements</i> (Ottawa: Department of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, 1985)	865
Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development, <i>Comprehensive Land Claims Policy</i> (1987)	873
Donald Purich, <i>The Inuit and Their Land</i> (1992)	885
Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, <i>British Columbia's Approach to Treaty Settlements - Lands and Resources</i> (May 12, 1995)	893

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, *Treaty Making in the Spirit of Co-Existence: An Alternative to Extinction* (1995) 906

Ministry of Indian Affairs and Northern Development: *Aboriginal Self-Government: The Government of Canada's Approach to Implementation of the Inherent Right and the Negotiation of Aboriginal Self-Government* (Ottawa: Supply and Services, 1995).....913

Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, *British Columbia's Approach to Treaty Settlements: Self-Government* (March 19, 1996).....931

E. **Aboriginal Government and Institutional Design**

David C. Hawkes and Allan M. Maslove, *Fiscal Arrangements for Aboriginal Self-Government*, in *Aboriginal Peoples and Government Responsibilities: Exploring Federal and Provincial Roles* (Hawkes & Maslove eds., 1989), 103-106 941

Noel Lyon, *Aboriginal Self-Government: Rights to Citizenship and Access to Governmental Services* (1984), at 48-69 944

C.E.S. Franks, *Public Administration Questions Relating to Aboriginal Self-Government* (1987) 952

John Weinstein, *Aboriginal Self-Determination Off a Land Base* (1986) 967

XIII. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN THE UNITED STATES

A. **General Principles**

Robert N. Clinton, Nell Jessup Newton and Monroe E. Price, *American Indian Law* (3d ed. 1991), 137-164 974

Ex Parte Crow Dog, 109 U.S. 556 (1883) 998

Sidney L. Haring, *Crow Dog's Case: American Indian Sovereignty, Tribal Law, and United States Law in the Nineteenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 101-130 1002

United States v. Kagama, 118 U.S. 375 (1886) 1008

<i>Lone Wolf v. Hitchcock</i> , 187 U.S. 554 (1903)	1010
<i>Tee-Hit-Ton Indians v. United States</i> , 348 U.S. 272 (1954)	1012
<i>Morton v. Mancari</i> , 417 U.S. 535 (1974)	1016
<i>Lyng v. Northwest Cemetery Protective Association</i> , 485 U.S. 439 (1988)	1024
B. Tribal Government	
<i>Talton v. Mayes</i> , 163 U.S. 376 (1896)	1037
<i>Oliphant v. Suquamish Indian Tribe</i> , 435 U.S. 191 (1978)	1041
<i>Duro v. Reina</i> , 110 Sup. Ct. 2053 (1990)	1046
Frank Pommersheim, <i>The Contextual Legitimacy of Adjudication in Tribal Courts and the Role of the Tribal Bar as an Interpretive Community: An Essay</i> , 18 New Mex. L. Rev. 49 (1988)	1052
XIV. INDIGENOUS PEOPLES IN AUSTRALIA AND NEW ZEALAND	
Garth Nettheim, <i>Australian Aborigines and the Law</i> (1987), 2 Law & Anthropology 371-84, 399-400	1068
<i>Mabo v. Queensland</i> , [1992] 5 C.N.L.R. 1 (Aust. H.C.)	1076
Aboriginal Provisional Government, <i>The Australian Constitution: An Aid to Justice or an Accomplice to Oppression</i> (June 4, 1993)	1096
<i>The Treaty of Waitangi</i> , 1975 New Zealand Statutes 114, Sch. 1	1113
E. Taihakurie Durie, <i>The New Zealand Maorie and the Waitangi Tribunal</i> , in <i>Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century</i> (K.E. Mahoney & P. Mahoney eds., 1993) 149-59	1116

